

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA

SEAN SMITH and CRYSTAL SMITH,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	
)	
v.)	Case No.: CIV-17-1302-D
)	
CSAA FIRE AND CASUALTY)	
INSURANCE COMPANY,)	
)	
Defendant.)	

**DEFENDANT’S MOTION FOR PARTIAL
SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND SUPPORTING BRIEF
TABLE OF CONTENTS AND AUTHORITIES**

Respectfully submitted,

Gerard F. Pignato, OBA No. 11473
R. Greg Andrews, OBA No. 19037
Dixie A. Craven, OBA No. 31528
PIGNATO, COOPER, KOLKER & ROBERSON, P.C.
Robinson Renaissance Building
119 North Robinson Avenue, 11th Floor
Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73102
Telephone: 405-606-3333
Facsimile: 405-606-3334
Email: jerry@pclaw.org
greg@andrews.law
dixie@pclaw.org

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT, CSAA
FIRE AND CASUALTY INSURANCE
COMPANY**

January 24, 2019

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES.....	ii, iii
BRIEF IN SUPPORT.....	1
FACTUAL BACKGROUND.....	1
STATEMENT OF MATERIAL, UNDISPUTED FACTS.	3
ARGUMENTS AND AUTHORITIES.....	12
PROPOSITION I: SUMMARY JUDGMENT STANDARD.....	12
PROPOSITION II: THE UNDISPUTED FACTS DEMONSTRATE, AS A MATTER OF LAW, THAT CSAA’S INVESTIGATION OF PLAINTIFFS’ EARTHQUAKE CLAIM WAS REASONABLE..	12
PROPOSITION III: PLAINTIFFS’ PUNITIVE DAMAGE CLAIM FAILS AS THE UNDISPUTED FACTS LACK EVIDENCE OF “RECKLESS DISREGARD.”.....	17
PROPOSITION IV: EVIDENCE OF ENGINEERING REPORTS FROM OTHER CLAIMS NOT INVOLVED IN THIS LAWSUIT CANNOT BE INTRODUCED AS EVIDENCE OF BAD FAITH.	18
A. Evidence of Other Rimkus Reports is Irrelevant to Plaintiffs’ Bad Faith Claim.....	19
B. Even if the Other Rimkus Reports are Relevant, Their Probative Value is Substantially Outweighed by Unfair Prejudice, Confusion of the Issues, Misleading the Jury, and Undue Delay. ...	20
C. Evidence of Other Reports is Inadmissible Evidence of Unrelated Conduct.....	22
D. If this Court Determined that the Other Reports are Admissible, Only Those Reports CSAA had at the Time Performance was Requested in this Case are Relevant.	23
E. Evidence of Other Reports is Inadmissible Hearsay.	24
CONCLUSION.....	24

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>Anderson v. Liberty Lobby</i> , 477 U.S. 242 (1986).....	12
<i>Badillo v. Mid Century Ins. Co.</i> , 121 P.3d 1080, 2005 OK 48,.....	13, 14, 18
<i>Birdsell v. Birdsell</i> , 671 P.2d 80, 1983 OK CIV APP 41.	19
<i>Black v. M & W Gear Co.</i> , 269 F.3d 1220 (10th Cir. (Okla.) 2001).....	19
<i>Buzzard v. McDanel</i> , 736 P.2d 157, 1987 OK 28.....	15, 16, 18
<i>Cardoso v. Calbone</i> , 490 F.3d 1194 (10th Cir. 2007).....	12
<i>Celotex Corp. v. Catrett</i> , 477 U.S. 317 (1986).....	12
<i>Christian v. American Home Assur. Co.</i> , 577 P.2d 899 (Okla. 1977).....	13, 19
<i>City Nat'l Bank and Trust Co. v. Jackson Nat'l Life Ins.</i> , 804 P.2d 463, 1990 OK CIV APP 89.	20
<i>Coletti v. Cudd Pressure Control</i> , 165 F.3d 767 (10th Cir. 1999).....	19
<i>Frank v. Mayberry</i> , 985 P.2d 773, 1999 OK 63.....	17
<i>Garnett v. Government Employees Ins. Co.</i> , 186 P.3d 935 (Okla. 2008).....	14
<i>Greenberg v. Service Business Forms Industries, Inc.</i> , 882 F.2d 1538 (10th Cir. (Okla.) 1989).....	19
<i>Lewis v. Farmers Ins. Co., Inc.</i> , 681 P.2d 67 (Okla. 1983).....	15

<i>McCorkle v. Great Atlantic Insurance Co.,</i> 637 P.2d 583, 1981 OK 128.	14
<i>Navarez v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co.,</i> 989 P.2d 1051, 1999 OK CIV APP 92.	14
<i>Owens v. State,</i> 229 P.3d 1261, 2010 OK CR 1.	22
<i>Porter v. Oklahoma Farm Bureau Mut. Ins. Co.,</i> 330 P.3d 511, 2014 OK 50	23, 24
<i>Roberts v. State Farm Mut. Auto,</i> 61 Fed.Appx. 587, 2003 WL 1559155, (10 th Cir. Mar. 26, 2003).....	16
<i>Rodebush by and through Rodebush v. Oklahoma Nursing Homes, Ltd.,</i> 867 P.2d 1241, 1993 OK 160.....	17
<i>Sides v. John Cordes, Inc.,</i> 981 P.2d 301, 1999 OK 36.....	17
<i>Skinner v. John Deere Ins. Co.,</i> 998 P.2d 1219, 2000 OK 18.....	13, 14
<i>Willis v. Midland Risk Ins. Co.,</i> 42 F.3d 607 (10 th Cir. 1994).....	14
<i>Wilson v. Muckala,</i> 303 F.3d 1207 (10 th Cir. 2002).	22, 23

Other Authorities

FED. R. CIV. P. 56.....	1, 12
FED.R.EVID. Rule 401.	19, 22
FED.R.EVID. Rule 403.	21, 22
FED.R.EVID. Rule 404	22
Local Civil Rule 56.1.....	1
23 O.S. § 9.1.	17

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Gerard F. Pignato

Gerard F. Pignato, OBA No. 11473

R. Greg Andrews, OBA No. 19037

Dixie A. Craven, OBA No. 31528

PIGNATO, COOPER, KOLKER & ROBERSON, P.C.

Robinson Renaissance Building

119 North Robinson Avenue, 11th Floor

Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73102

Telephone: 405-606-3333

Facsimile: 405-606-3334

Email: jerry@pclaw.org

greg@andrews.law

dixie@pclaw.org

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT, CSAA
FIRE AND CASUALTY INSURANCE
COMPANY**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 24, 2019, I electronically transmitted the attached document to the Clerk of Court using the ECF System for filing. Based on the records currently on file, the Clerk of Court will transmit a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following ECF registrants:

Steven S. Mansell, Esquire

Mark A. Engel, Esquire

Kenneth G. Cole, Esquire

M. Adam Engel, Esquire

s/ Gerard F. Pignato

For the Firm